



# **PCERII Funded Research**

## **Progress Report**

### **Citizenship Values: A State of the Art Study**

Yvonne Hébert

*University of Calgary*

with

Charles Ungerleider

**University of British Columbia**

**March 1999**

## **1. Brief Statement of Research Problem and Key Research Questions**

Citizenship education is of primary importance to the construction of a sense of belonging which underlies the civic participation of newcomers to Canadian society. Yet there is no systematic body of research on this topic, with a notable research gap on the citizenship values and principles held by Canadians including immigrants and refugees.

*Objectives.* A state of the art study of the values held and the extent to which they are prepared to change is proposed with two research objectives:

- (1) to provide a comprehensive critical analysis of the Canadian and international literature on citizenship values and principles; and
- (2) to establish the basis of the next phases of a much larger research project.

*Significance.* This study is the first and fundamental phase of a series of research projects on Canadian citizenship values, one of four themes established in late March 1998 as part of a national research agenda on citizenship education at the historic Kananaskis Think Tank attended by a pan-Canadian group of educational researchers, practitioners and policy makers; as a result of the June 1, 1998 follow-up meeting of this group, the project is now known as the Citizenship Education Research Network. This study is also situated within the Values Shift group within the Project on Trends, mounted by SSHRC in Spring 1999, in collaboration with the Policy Research Secretariat of the Privy Council; team leader for the Values Shift group is Dr. Neil Nevitte (U Toronto). Of direct relevance to the research agenda of the CERN, the research results are expected to be of immense importance to educational and governmental policy makers, practitioners and the general public.

## **2. Research Methodology**

This study is carried out by means of a thorough documentary analysis of the current state of research as well as the attitudinal studies in Canada, public opinion polls, as well as national and international legislative and government policies on citizenship values in Canada, how these vary among groups and how these interact. Our critical analysis also includes an evaluation of current policies and practices of government departments as well as those of schools and community-based citizenship education groups, to see if they match the citizenship values and principles held by individuals in this country.

The definition and identification of “citizenship values and principles” is to be ascertained, from the academic and governmental literature, including federal and international law and documents that have citizenship concerns. Next, the various uses of the concepts are to be examined in order to highlight the gaps and inconsistencies in the literature and to establish key questions to be addressed in future research. And finally, a conceptual and pragmatic framework is to be developed to guide future research on Canadian values held by different groups of Canadians with respect to citizenship and immigration issues. The final product of this state of the art review is to consist of an extensive paper, accompanied by an annotated bibliography, examining the work carried out to date on citizenship values, in Canada and in other countries.

### **3. Research Progress to Date**

To date, two preliminary draft versions have been produced by Lori Wilkinson, in consultation with Yvonne Hébert. At the first working meeting of the Values Shift team, held in Calgary on January 9, 1999, and attended by most members including both Lori Wilkinson and Yvonne Hébert, Lori presented a preliminary analysis of the literature extensively reviewed to date. Given the interests of other members among whom political scientists figure prominently, we will give additional attention to the definition and clarification of citizenship values, thus providing a foundation for the other papers, as much of the other work presumes underlying values without making these explicit.

At the Third National Metropolis conference held in Vancouver, January 14-16, Lori Wilkinson presented a second version of her work, within the Citizenship and Civic Education sessions of the Metropolis Education Research Forum (MERF). See below, in 4, a summary of the argumentation presented. As a result of the animated discussion which ensued, attention will be given to the clarification of terms used, notably the distinction between conceptions of citizenship and an underlying concept or essence of citizenship, as well as the distinction between singular and multiple notions of citizenship.

Preparations are now underway for three more meetings: (i) the next meeting of the Citizenship Education Research Network, planned as a pre-conference day, organized within the programme of the Comparative and International Education Society of Canada, as part of the upcoming annual CSSE conference within the Congress of the Social Sciences and Humanities, to be held in Sherbrooke, June 9-12, 1999; (ii) the next meeting of the Metropolis Education Research Forum (MERF) within the CSSE conference in Sherbrooke; and (iii) the next meeting of the Values Shift team, under the direction of Dr. Neil Nevitte, scheduled for mid-June 1999 in Toronto. As currently planned, this latter meeting is expected to prepare a Fall '99 public presentation of the results of the Values Shift team.

Given the extensive participation in the development of the CERN research agenda, consultation with the Values group will occur prior to the next meetings. Members of the Values group within CERN include: John Kabano (UQAR), Jeff Bullard (Manager, Strategic Research, Canadian Heritage); John Biles (Strategic Research, Canadian Heritage; and Metropolis Project, CIC); as well as Yvonne Hébert (UC), Charles Ungerleider (UBC/Deputy Minister, BC Ministry of Education) and Lori Wilkinson (UA). With respect to the three meetings, Lori will present formally at two of them, the MERF and SSHRC Values Shift team meetings, whereas at the MERF meetings which are planned as working group discussions, Lori will draw from her experiences in carrying out this study to contribute without making a formal presentation. Given the extensive nature of discussions likely to occur in Sherbrooke, we also note that there is a brief time interval between this meeting and the one in Toronto, allowing for some minor modifications to hone the analysis and interpretation, as needed.

### **4. Preliminary Findings**

Upon the basis of a documentary review and analysis, it is argued that Canadian government policies and laws represent different conceptions of Canadian citizenship, some reflecting a narrow conception of citizenship as a set of legal obligations and entitlements, and others, a more inclusive conception which recognizes differences among citizens and addresses social

inequities. Evidence is brought to bear from policies of the federal department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada, some of which are directed towards immigrants in a very supportive manner and some of which are directed towards Canadians who are already here and which view immigration as a source of maximal benefit to the interests of the Canadian-born population. According to this analysis, the first policy position is consistent with the Multiculturalism Act and with the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, as it leaves open the possibility of various ways of being a Canadian, i.e., multiple citizenship, whereas the second one, a unitary view of Canadian citizenship, does not. Evidence drawn from research on the citizenship education of adult immigrants is also brought to bear, as reflecting a singular view of citizenship and not conducive to full participation or to different ways of being Canadian.

## **5. Policy Implications**

The study of citizenship values has great implications for the integration of immigrant and refugee children and adults. Without clarity in the definition of Canadian citizenship values, how can immigrants be expected to integrate successfully into Canadian society? Shedding additional light on the process of integration so as to enhance understanding, this study relates directly to the overall theme of the work of the Prairie Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Integration, which focuses on *becoming Canadian*. As well, this research has the potential for enhancing the mutual understandings of different cultures among native-born Canadians for, without knowing oneself, one cannot learn, accept and receive the cultures of others.

More specifically, this study will serve to inform policy makers directly particularly within federal departments such as Citizenship and Immigration Canada and Canadian Heritage who together bear major responsibility for assuring the socialization of immigrants, refugees and native-born Canadians for the roles, rights and responsibilities of citizenship in Canada.

This work is also directly and indirectly relevant to the on-going work of the Council of Ministers of Education, Canada on citizenship education as well as the more diffuse provincial policy development processes of educational policy and practices so that citizenship curricula, for both children and adults, in design and in implementation, can better deal with the actual citizenship values prevalent in Canadian society.

## **6. Staffing for the Conduct of Research**

This project provides graduate support for Lori Wilkinson (Sociology, U Alberta/PCERII) who is centrally responsible for carrying out the literature and documentary review, in consultation with Dr. Yvonne Hébert (U Calgary), with communication occurring mostly via e-mail and telephone; and to a lesser extent via fax and ordinary mail. Having attended the Kananaskis Think Tank and participated in the discussion of the Values group, Lori accepted the responsibility to prepare the foundational paper on citizenship values so as to inform the subsequent work on values within the pan-Canadian research agenda. She was also instrumental in the preparation of the requests for funding from PCERII and SSHRC. At the next stage of development, consultation will also occur, via e-mail, with the project's advisory committee, consisting of members of the Values group within the CERN research agenda. This broader consultation will provide Lori with additional input and support in the processes of analysis and interpretation inherent to this study.

## 7. Dissemination Activities

The results of the state of the art review are targeted to several audiences: academic, educational and federal policy makers, practitioner groups; as well as making use of various formats: print, television, video-media and electronic, all in a partnership approach.

To date, one formal presentation has been made:

Wilkinson, Lori, Yvonne Hébert and Charles Ungerleider. 1999. « Whose Citizenship is this Anyway? A Divergence in Practice and Policy for Immigrants and Refugees in Canada. » Presentation by Lori Wilkinson (U Alberta) at the Third National Metropolis Conference, Metropolis Education and Research Forum (MERF), held in Vancouver, January 14-16.

Besides writing articles for specific academic journals, such as *Canadian Public Policy*, *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, and *Canadian Journal of Education*, other forae of interest to this research project include the *CSSE Newsletter/Bulletin de la SCÉÉ*, and the quarterly *Citizenship, Democracy and Ethnocultural Diversity Newsletter* under the direction of Prof. Will Kymlicka (Queen's U), both in electronic format via e-mail with postings on the respective web sites. Results would also be send to or presented in other academic and educational organizations, such as ACFAS, CEA, CTF and its provincial affiliates such as ATA, BCTF, CEQ, as well as the Research and Statistics Council of the CMEC. It is expected that this form of distribution would spur discussions concerning citizenship issues that would affect future educational curricula.

In-kind support from the Multiculturalism Directorate, Canadian Heritage (CH) and the Metropolis Project, CIC, would also be involved in the dissemination of the research results. Current plans foresee the following innovative forms of dissemination:

- (a) Of particular interest is the about-to-be-released *Evidence Series*, being established by CH to discuss myths perpetuated by the media and public discourse, and intended for public education with well-summarized issues.
- (b) Release of our results to key individuals in the print and video media who report on multicultural and immigration issues would be facilitated by CH whose representatives as CERN members, have agreed to provide us their list for this project.
- (c) Publishing the results in languages other than French and English will also be explored, as will funding sources for translation and interest in the ethnic media.
- (d) Dissemination via an electronic discussion group, e-mail and the CERN web site will also be sought. We note that the Multiculturalism Directorate, Canadian Heritage, has already mounted a web page for CERN as an in-kind contribution, within the Metropolis web site.
- (e) Since this is also a SSHRC Values Shift project, linked to the Policy Research Secretariat as well as the Canadian Policy Research Network (CPRN), our work will also be brought to their attention for further discussion and dissemination.
- (f) As well, non-profit private groups, such as Celebration Canada and the Dominion Institute will be approached with our research results, as will CFMT, a multilingual television station in Toronto.

**8. Actual or Projected Dates of Completion**

This bulk of this project is expected to be completed in Fall 1999 with the following activities:

- (i) Presentation of the ensuing final paper at the public forum being planned as part of the SSHRC Values Shift work;
- (ii) Circulation of the paper or a different version to the members of the Values group within CERN so as to inform further work on the pan-Canadian research agenda; and
- (iii) Posting the paper in the Virtual Library of the Metropolis web site.

Follow-up work may include preparation of an edited version for a popularized book on Values Shift to be edited by Neil Nevitte, either as part of the SSHRC project or beyond it. See discussion in 7 Dissemination for additional information on projected follow-up.