PCERII Funded Research

Progress Report

The Influence of Contexts on Identity Formation Among Adolescent Immigrants

Yvonne Hébert

University of Calgary

March 1999
1. **Brief Statement of Research Problem and Key Research Questions**

This research project focuses on *school and community contexts* as these contribute to *identity formation* among immigrant youth from selected groups in Calgary, based on the broadly accepted hypothesis that identity formation is key to integration. Identity formation is understood to be a dynamic process that aims at individual uniqueness within a group having a shared sense of peoplehood and that involves multiple social dimensions.

The *objectives of this project* are to describe and compare the school and community contexts of selected immigrant groups as these pertain to identity formation of adolescents, 13 years or more, enrolled in secondary school institutions, at the beginning of the project. Given that adolescence is a time of searching for self, of detachment from parents, of the development of life ideals and roles, the study of the influence of new contexts is of particular importance as the adolescents’ construction of self as a human being, as a member of the host country and as a citizen occurs crucially in context. In this study, we examine those cultural contexts which bear upon the formation of identity among immigrant youth for knowledge, including self-knowledge, is socially constructed.

*Key research questions* ask what strategies used to balance the two main aspects of identity-formation, namely, individual coherence and continuity, within highly divergent life situations among the youth of immigrant populations, especially in school and community settings.

2. **Research Methodology**

Set within the *qualitative research paradigm*, particularly the traditions of ethnography of communication and symbolic interactionism, this research project assumes an inductive methodology. Emerging from the research experience, the sampling, analytic categories and hypotheses are progressively determined and made more precise by means of fieldwork systematizing the groups, actions, words and conditions observed. In order to discover truths which may illuminate dimensions of the research problem, qualitative researchers become research instruments themselves and propose questions of participants. The internal validity and reliability of the data are assured by the multiplicity of sources of data permitting triangulation. This is actualized by means of a return to the original source, documentary analysis and comparisons with other experiential data, be it from our study or from other case studies elsewhere.

*Preparation.* Within this paradigm, researchers prepare themselves with a thorough review of the literature on the topic and the drafting of possible questions, drawing from a wide range of dimensions germane to identity formation, including socio-structural factors of ethnic/immigrant community vitality; socio-educational factors; as well as external and internal factors, all thought to be part of identity formation. Although differing in their specifics and perspectives, questions for interviews with parents and community leaders dealt with language, traditions, religion, race, identification markers, relationships, community, and citizenship, with child-rearing and schooling also part of those with parents. Questions for interviews with educators dealt with cultural and ethnic background of teachers, staff and students; teacher and staff/students relationship; teaching and evaluation approaches; identification markers; language; traditions; religion; relationships; race; academics; social participation, work and leisure; and citizenship.
**Shared Commonalities and Self-Reflection.** During the preparatory and data collection stages occurred within the research team, an importance questioning of one’s own identity and position within the participant groups as well as for the possible influence which researchers may wittingly or not have on the outcomes of qualitative research. An inherent part of this type of research methodology, this dialogic self-examination with respect to our own identifications, multiple in nature and flexible of situation, obliged us to situate ourselves in order to better understand the phenomena in question and to develop further insights.

**Research participants** in Calgary were selected from among recent immigrant groups from different world regions, according to the availability of in-group research assistants: Blacks from Central and Southern Africa; Muslims from the Middle East; and Isma’ilis from Central and Eastern Africa. The parents and community leaders were interviewed by three research assistants, each of whom was a member of one of the participating groups, whereas the educators were interviewed by the principal investigator.

**Data Collection.** Using a snowball technique to identify participants, forty-eight interviews were realized, with seventeen parents, twenty community leaders and eleven educators. All recorded on audio-tape, these semi-structured interviews range in length (1-4 hrs) and in location (typically the participants preferred place, be it home, office, small café or other public place). Some of the researchers also attended community gatherings occurring during the data collection period in order to confirm working hypotheses and the systematization of the emerging analytic dimensions.

3. **Research Progress to Date**

Some delays were experienced in starting the research study due largely to the time involved in obtaining ethical approvals from the university and the school system and in obtaining the services of research assistants who were also in-group members as such candidates do not necessarily meet and overcome institutional requirements for advanced study. As a result, the preparatory period occurred in Winter 1997 and the data collection period stretched from Spring into Fall 1997 which also included the identification of emerging issues and patterns in the data. Since then to Winter 1999, efforts have focussed upon the analysis of this corpus of rich and nuanced data; the selection of appropriate theoretical perspectives which involves a return to the literature review as well as additional documentary research; the preparation and presentation of several conference papers (1998-1999). These papers, listed below in section 7, are now either in press or in preparation for posting in the Virtual Library of the Metropolis project and then submission for publication.

4. **Preliminary Findings and Expected Applications**

Given the necessity for some degree of coherence in identity formation among immigrants who must reconstruct themselves in a new context, the data were examined from several perspectives. Since we are interested in strategies favouring integration, a relevant typology is Camilleri’s\(^1\) which distinguishes between simplex or complex identity strategies. The former permit

coherence with one point of reference at a time, be it the cultural group of origin or the dominant group of the host society whereas the latter permit both an investment in the group of origin and an adaptation to the host society. In order to determine how adolescents form their personal and collective identities, as influenced and perceived by parents and community leaders, several analyses were carried out. Four of these assume a strategic perspective and two others, a symbolic interactional one, presented here under five thematic categories. The authors of the various papers are noted in parentheses and listed in 7 on Research Dissemination.

1) Mixity and Fidelity to Self. Generally, the results of our study (Hébert, 1998a,b,c; 1999) demonstrate that immigrant youth simultaneously adopt a wide range of identity strategies, be these simplex or complex, according to the situations of the context, being little preoccupied with the exclusive application of strategies of one type or another on a daily basis. As an identity principle, mixity reigns for these youth are seen as wanting to be part of both their groups of origin as well as the host society without paying an exorbitant price such as the rejection of one or the other, be it by means of food, linguistic proficiency, dress or social relations. For our youth, as reported by parents, community leaders and educators, the use of identity strategies is based upon a flexible, open and exploratory individuality, lived as a “fidelity to self” with respect to an individual positioning favourable to a personal coherence and the inherent tensions of the process of immigration in a pluralist and integrationist society.

2) Disparate, Fragmentary Views of Language and Citizenship. Focussing upon the educators’ perceptions with respect to the importance of language to identity and citizenship as part of collective identity, a more specific analysis (Hébert, 1997) examines data on language use in school settings, reported language competencies and code switching, the nature of official language instruction (ESL) and of citizenship education, immigrant students’ reported strategies for coping with language learning and sociolinguistic tensions, as well as the role of the school with respect to pluralism. While all the educators’ interviewed shared the view that English is the language of wider communication within school and society, few of them were consciously aware of the links between language, identity, power; or of the negative impact of labelling as “ESL student” and the spatial marginalization of ESL programs in some of the schools, even if their data is revealing in these regards. Views of citizenship were similarly disparate, fragmentary and even contradictory, situated over a continuum between passivity and activity, into six partial conceptions: (1) the citizen is an obedient subject with civic and political rights and duties; (2) the citizen participates actively in society, making a positive contribution; (3) the citizen constructs him/herself by consciously drawing from his/her origins and from the new society, so as to be a unique person; (4) the citizen is closely tied to the country for family, personal and educational advantages; (5) the citizen is characterized by feelings of pride and allegiance as well as basic common values, attitudes and behaviours; and finally, (6) the citizen sees value and acceptance in diversity. Not only are these views of language and citizenship, contradictory in and among themselves, but some educators also evince opposing fragments within their discourse.

From this rich, nuanced and complex data, it is possible to conclude that it may well be normal to have contradictory views, to hold onto fragments of perceptions and experiences, to articulate disparate conceptions of citizenship and of language, for we are always in a process of becoming. While language is considered to be instrumentally essential to citizenship, to pass the
citizenship test and citizenship ceremony, to participate in society, to uphold rights and duties, to contribute to society, to construct oneself, to give allegiance, to celebrate diversity, its link is articulated here by educators as a “stepping stone”. According to our analysis, the link between language and citizenship may be understood in terms of power relationships which revolve around integration, negotiation and strategizing so as to creatively construct oneself as “Canadian citizen” through space, discourse and hybridity.

3) Religion as Central Marker of Collective Identity within a Diverse Community. An exploration of the languages and collective identity among Shi’a Imami Isma’ili Muslims of Calgary (Murji and Hébert, 1999) reveals that the basis of collective identity is in question given the remarkable diversity within this community, in terms of countries of origin, races, ethnicities and languages. From a detailed analysis of the relationships between languages, faith, settlement patterns, community cohesion and collective identity in the interview data of parents and community leaders, emerges the finding that religion holds central defining value. Furthermore, the construction of a new social order in a new context and the maintenance of social cohesion among members of this community benefit from the implementation of strategies\(^2\) such as collective action; sensitivity to processes of interiorization of group identity; semantic reversal in favour of a positive group identity; and the conscientization of identity recomposition. In light of its diversity, citizenship is seen by the research participants’ as a complex process which offers individual rights while allowing for group membership, seeking to balance openness with discrimination and prejudice for integration is a difficult concept to live and experience. The role of the community leadership is seen to be essential to facilitating individual and collective integration in Canadian society which means the creation of new hybrid identities, representative of both the linguistic violence of resettlement and an idealized hope in new contexts.

4) Racialized Identity as Central to both Individual and Collective Identity. Coming from the large region south of the Sahara, Black Africans in Calgary have adopted a range of complex strategies so as to be able to integrate themselves into the Canadian social context (Kariyo Musuku, 1998). They try to transmit their cultural heritages to their children while encouraging them to integrate themselves into the host society. “You are Canadians but do not forget your roots, that’s important” is the phrase that guides the parents in their tactics for adjustment into the new social context. Without neglecting other traits of identity such as the territory of origin and some cultural practices, a racialized identity is unavoidably centralized. On the basis of the data as well as from her observations and lived experiences, Kariyo Musuku points out that the American model of racialization does not apply in the Canadian context, as the former is lodged in the experiences of slavery and the concomitant power relationships involving an involuntary minority, whereas this is definitely not the case of the recent migrants from sub-Saharan Africa and their Canadian experience, although a racialized identity is unavoidable.

Applying an inventory of identity strategies,\(^3\) Kariyo Musuku found that the strategy of collective action is one that is favoured by those wishing to have community associations serve


\(^3\)Taboada-Leonetti (1997), ibid.
as frames of identity references, so as to realize their identity in interaction with others, for example, with the selection of friends and in instilling respect for elders. In forming an African association and in being part of a number of multicultural groups in the city, parents and community leaders struggle with an ascribed identity and try to make use of it, as a minoritized, “inferior” group, so as to benefit from some attention in negotiating with dominant power groups, such as the city. The instrumentalization of identity seems to be a very useful strategy in this case. As part of their collective identity, Black Africans seem to retain the notion of belonging with respect to their respective tribes and ethnicities of origins, while seeking to remain identified in terms of their country of origins and their country of adoption. In our analysis, this mixed approach is seen as a strategy of avoidance, as the new immigrant seeks to avoid having to make a decision while keeping options open. In a similar approach, religion is left to individual choices and parental transmission and responsibility.

Since most Africans are multilingual by reason of the complex context of origin and patterns of intermarriage, maintaining these languages in the Canadian context does not seem to be an important factor of identification. Moreover, the gradual loss of traditional languages as elements of cultural identification originated during the colonial period in which either French or English became a lingua franca although traditional languages are maintained as in-group languages. With the transition over time from colonialism to a new country, the loss of languages of origin is completed, moving from African parental multilingualism to monolingualism among the youth in Canada, as traditional languages are set aside and reduced when their usage no longer occurs daily or permanently, resulting in English linguistic assimilation for Black youth.

Finally, the strategy of complex coherence\(^4\) applies only partially to these data, to the extent that adolescents may adjust, merge and integrate Canadian cultural elements with elements of their culture of origin. While the adolescents also recognize the cultural values of the group of origin such as traditional dress and food, as reported by their parents, their applicability seems difficult in the new life context.

\(e\) Religion as a Organizing Concept for Raising Children in a New Context. For Muslim parents, immigrated from the Middle East and members of several sects, religion overrides ethnicity as an organizing concept, thus allowing them to deal with cross-gender relationships and more generally to make sense of their adolescents’ complex identifications (Montazer, 1998a, 1998b). Serving as the central factor of collective identity, a common religion permits shared values regarding cross-gender relationships which are influenced by several factors such as length of residence in Canada, reasons for immigration, sociocultural background and nationality. Although interpretations of cross-gender relationships vary within a conservative perspective, ranging from more to less accommodating, these are substantially linked by religious frames of reference and therefore constitute a reality among Muslim families. In this case, ethnicity is considered to be an achieved, situational and ascribed phenomenon of identification\(^5\) whereby religion is the unifying factor providing a frame of reference for the

---

\(^4\) Camilleri (1997), Identité et gestion de la disparité culturelle, op. cit.

Muslims parents, one that is respectful and supportive of parental authority and responsibility, in new contexts where traditional parental roles and authority are difficult to maintain.

The Middle-Eastern Muslim parents are generally active participants in their adolescents’ worlds through complex and flexible processes of interaction, combined with an awareness of the interplay between personal and contextual features, so as to create meanings and to negotiate the perception and realities of their offspring and others. It is through the religion that parents connect to their cultures of origin and to the host society, so as to exercise and maintain some degree of control over their situations, to reduce cultural or cognitive dissonance as well as to retain and reinforce their traditional values and life styles connected to patterns of parental authority.

5. Policy Implications of the Research Work
The results of our study suggest that governmental, socio-cultural and educational policies and practices designed for immigrant youth would best serve them by providing support and guidance for their explorations of self within school and community contexts, from an understanding point of view that their transformation occurs over a relatively short and intensive period of time.

Multiculturalism and Citizenship Policies. The Canadian policy of multiculturalism, as articulated in 1971, has played a critical role in the establishment of the Shi’a Imami Isma’ili Muslims of Calgary. Within the policy framework, the Isma’ili community not only found opportunities to enhance their lifestyle in Canada but did so, without having to give up their identity or compromise on their traditions and customs. A later arrival of a second group of Isma’ilis in more recent years, arriving mainly from Central Asia (Tajikistan and Afghanistan), with a small number from Iran and Syria, brings significantly different cultures, traditions and languages, which means that the community now faces another opportunity, that of implementing this same multiculturalism policy internally. Given the significance of human rights, of multiculturalism as well as the critical role of community leadership, conceptions of citizenship and policies of pluralism must continue to balance individual rights and group membership. Moreover, the preservation and enhancement of collective identities as well as a commitment to democratic representative government within a communitarian understanding of liberal citizenship are key to the successful integration of groups such as the Ismaili Muslims.

Although the Isma’ili community is more extensively organized than the other Muslim sects as well as the African groups within their numerous associations, a communitarian approach to integration and citizenship is equally relevant. This means legitimizing different ways of belonging to a common polity; preserving essential defining elements of personal and collective identities such as language, gender, ethnicity, religion and race; protecting the bounded nature of communities and emphasizing collective identities; as well as enhancing collaboration between schools and ethnocultural community groups.

Educational Policy and Practices. Given the disparate, contradictory and fragmentary views of language and citizenship among the educators’ interviewed, socio-educational policies concerning citizenship and the mission of the school with respect to immigration, minorities in general and integration, need to be clarified. More specifically, in light of the current renewal of
Social Studies programs of studies in the Western provinces, an emphasis on citizenship education is recommended, one that is consistent with the communitarian view of liberal citizenship which allows for the development of explicit curriculum materials as well as extensive professional development as part of implementation. Given the modelling and instructional roles of ESL teachers, it is also relevant for educational philosophies and sociolinguistic approaches underlying these programs to be clarified, materials developed that adequately situate language use within power relations and collective identity, including being an active citizen. And finally, since educational administrators are also curriculum leaders, it is important for school districts and provincial departments of education to promote professional development dealing with immigration, integration and citizenship, and to include administrators as participants in such initiatives.

Given the importance according to religion and to race among the Muslim and African groups of immigrant parents and community leaders interviewed, and especially to the unavoidable nature of racialized identity, it behoves the school system to look at adolescents’ lives through their home and community contexts in order to enrich our vision and understanding of influences upon educational and social dimensions of their lives. Thus, curriculum, programs of studies, and more generally the provision of educational services and facilities need to take this diversity into consideration. This means inviting educators, translators and interpreters, counsellors, Muslim and African parents and community leaders, specialists in Islamic thought and practices, as well as those in race relations, to come together to develop understanding and to enhance communication. Children and adults alike need to be knowledgeable about and emphatic towards others, familiar with the realities of their lives and skillful in interpersonal and group interactions and transactions, so as to be able to live together peacefully in a society characterized by considerable diversity. Thus, educational policies and practices are to be fine-tuned so as to enhance the mutuality and dialogic nature of the home-school-community relationships for the benefit of adolescents who are in the process of becoming Canadian.

6. **Staffing for the Conduct of Research**

This particular research project employed three research assistants:

- **Zahra Montazer**, a doctoral student from Iran;
- **Jeanne Kariyo Musuku**, a recent immigrant from Belgium and Burundi, with the equivalent of two masters from Belgium as well as previous research experience with the Black Africans in Antwerp; and

---

All three were involved in extensive training and support in the preparation of the questions for the interviews, in the realization of the interviews themselves, in assuring the long and difficult transcriptions, as well as in the analysis of their data. All of them were funded to travel to conferences to present their papers and encouraged to revise them thereafter. Regular meetings were held, for the purposes of training as well as project implementation, on a weekly basis during the preparatory stages, bi-weekly during the data collection period and for the dialogic identification of patterns and issues during the analytic stages, and as needed during the writing and re-writing stages.

Since then,  
- **Dr. Zahra Montazer** has completed her doctorate, under the supervision of Dr. Tom Gougeon, served as postdoctoral fellow at UBC in the Faculty of Education (1997-1998) and is currently taking technological upgrading in Vancouver.
- **Jeanne Kariyo Musuku** is pursuing a one-year programme of studies (1998-1999) so as to obtain a Canadian teaching certificate, thus building upon her previous certification and teaching experience in Burundi, in order for her to assure the future of her two children. Her original plans to complete a doctorate so as to become a teacher educator and researcher have been set aside until a later date, possibly in 5-6 years.
- **Rani Murji** returned from Cambridge University, having successfully completed her M. Phil. (Social and Educational Studies), and is continuing to serve as research assistant in a follow-up study. The possibility of enrolling in a doctoral program at the University of Calgary and doing her dissertation research on this and subsequent data on the identity formation of immigrant youth remains an open and viable option.

7. **Dissemination Activities**

   **Conference Presentations:**

   Hébert, Yvonne et Jim Frideres. 1999. Il y avait une fois... Calgary et ses immigrés. Communication faisant partie d’une symposium comparatif entre les villes de Marseille, Calgary et Francfort-sur-le-Main, organisé par Alain Moreau et Alexandra Schleyer-Lindenmann (Université d’Aix-Marseille II), pour le VIIè Congrès international de l’Association pour la recherche interculturelle, qui aura lieu à l’Université Paris X - Nanterre, du 29 juin au 3 juillet. Suivi de séance de posters affichant nos recherches et celles de quelques collègues de l’U Calgary. (Symposium describing and comparing the three cities, with respect to immigration, followed by a poster session presenting several PCERII research projects including our own.)

   Murji, Rani and Yvonne Hébert. 1999. Languages and Collective Identity Among Shi’a Imami Isma’ili Muslims of Calgary. Revised paper to be presented by the second author at the “Youth in the Plural City: Individualized and Collectivized Identity Projects”, a working conference to be held at the Inter-University Center, Dubrovnik, May 24-28.


Papers Published:


Media Interviews:
Further Dissemination Plans: Although follow-up plans are still indefinite, there are several possibilities that have been or are being discussed, most of which are long-range in that they may take well over a year to be formalized. (a) One consists of further analyses of the data by members of the research team. In particular, Rani Murji, is contemplating a paper in terms of gender issues; this is particularly feasible, as she is still with the longer term research project. (b) As the data is very rich, another one is the idea of turning several of the above papers into a monograph or book; however, this may await the data analysis of the next stage of the study which focuses on the adolescents’ themselves with respect to their spatiality, associativity, language learning and usage, narrativity, as well as personal development, all in terms of a posited underlying strategic competence. (c) Thirdly, working with two colleagues at U d’Aix-Marseille II, Alain Moreau and Alexandra Schleyer-Lindenmann, comparative analyses of the data are underway, tentatively in terms of concepts such as spaces, internal coherence and continuity, linking up to the data and results of their own extensive research programmes. And finally, (d) currently under development with colleagues in Marseille, Aix-en-Provence, Nice and Montréal, some of whom are Canadians on sabbatical in the region during part of 1999 (including the principal investigator), a longer work is envisaged, either a book or a special thematic edition of a journal, with a unifying theme, possibly “Échelles et espaces/Scales and Spaces”.

8. Actual or Projected Dates of Completion
The research project is completed in that the data has been collected, analyzed, written up and presented publicly. In the follow-up period, the necessary work will be undertaken to prepare the material for posting in the Metropolis Virtual Library, for publication of the results in various academic and educational formats, as well as for distribution of copies and/or summaries to interested participants and the Calgary school boards.