

# The development of *that said*

Laurel J. Brinton

University of British Columbia

<http://faculty.arts.ubc.ca/lbrinton/>

[brinton@interchange.ubc.ca](mailto:brinton@interchange.ubc.ca)



## The collocation *that/this said* in Present-day English

- There are three different passive forms and one active form:
  - {*that, this*} *said*                      vs.                      *having said* {*that, this*}
  - {*that, this*} *being said*
  - {*that, this*} *having been said*
- The *OED* included it only in a draft 2007 entry in the 3<sup>rd</sup> online edition (s.v. *say*).
- It is analyzable as an “absolute construction” within the class of supplements, or “elements which occupy a position in linear sequence without being integrated into the syntactic structure of the sentence” (Huddleston and Pullum 2002:1350).
  - absolutes express adverbial notions such as cause, condition, time, concession, manner, and attendant circumstances (see Poutsma 1905:727-728; Jespersen 1946:61ff; Curme 1931:155-157)
  - specifically, *that said* is a contrastive-concessive disjunct (Quirk et al. 1985:623n, 636)



## Attention to the constructions in more popular literature

- Safire (2002) decries *that said* as a “self-referential voguism” that is “sweeping the country” but after a detailed discussion of its function, including a comparison with *to be sure*, admits that it “has its good side”.
- Garner (2003) observes that *having said that* “is a frequent source of DANGLERS” when not anchored to a speaker in the main clause. He advises deleting the “casualism” as it “doesn’t say much anyway”
  - Quirk et al. (1985:623n) claim that *having said that* “has become so stereotyped that it can violate” the “subject-attachment rule”
  - Curme (1931:158-159) too sees the dangling or hanging participle as “established” in this case because the construction is no longer connected with a subject at all (cf. also Poutsma 1905:720)

## Examples of *that said* constructions in Present-Day English

- We have a clear frontrunner with Barack Obama. **That said**, all the sort of dancing on Hillary's grave I think is premature. (COCA:SPOK)
- I have total confidence he will get it done. **That being said**, you don't see hardly anybody with a perfect score for their entire career ... (COCA:NEWS)
- What is important, to restate, is that they have found no cases of human to human transmission. ... Well, **that having been said**, experts say that could come at any time. (COCA:SPOK)
- In general, tribunal chairmen are well-informed and familiar with most authorities. **Having said that**, most cases turn on their facts and not on points of legal principle. (BNC: F9B)










 Frequency of collocations in COCA and BNC

	COCA	BNC
{that, this} said,		
[punc] {that, this} said,	773	134
[conj] {that, this} said,	67	5
[prep] {that, this} said,	52	3
all (of) {that, this} said,	59	4
{that, this} being said	172	16
{that, this} having been said	36	4
Total passive forms	1159	166
<b>Frequency per million – passive forms</b>	<b>2.89</b>	<b>1.90</b>
having said {that, this}	698	247
<b>Frequency per million – active forms</b>	<b>1.73</b>	<b>2.82</b>

 COCA: [*that/this said* , ]

CLICK ON BARS FOR LIST OF MATCHING STRINGS






(HELP)

SECTION	SPOKEN	FICTION	MAGAZINE	NEWSPAPER	ACADEMIC	1990-1994	1995-1999	2000-2004	2005-2009	
SEE ALL SECTIONS										
	<b>PER MIL</b>	<b>8.1</b>	<b>3.0</b>	<b>6.3</b>	<b>4.6</b>	<b>2.4</b>	<b>3.0</b>	<b>4.0</b>	<b>5.7</b>	<b>7.5</b>
	SIZE (MW)	81.7	78.8	83.3	79.4	79.3	103.3	102.9	102.6	93.6
	FREQ	661	237	526	369	193	305	413	585	699

 **BNC: [*that/this said* , ]**

CLICK ON BARS FOR LIST OF MATCHING STRINGS










(HELP)

SECTION	SPOKEN	FICTION	NEWSPAPER	ACADEMIC	MISC
<b>SEE ALL SECTIONS</b>					
<b>PER MIL</b>	<b>1.1</b>	<b>0.8</b>	<b>2.2</b>	<b>0.8</b>	<b>2.4</b>
SIZE (MW)	10.0	15.9	10.5	15.3	44.6
FREQ	11	12	23	13	109

 **COCA: [having said that/this ,]**

CLICK ON BARS FOR LIST OF MATCHING STRINGS

(HELP)






SECTION	SPOKEN	FICTION	MAGAZINE	NEWSPAPER	ACADEMIC	1990-1994	1995-1999	2000-2004	2005-2009
<b>SEE ALL SECTIONS</b>									
	<b>6.0</b>	<b>0.4</b>	<b>0.6</b>	<b>0.9</b>	<b>0.8</b>	<b>1.5</b>	<b>1.7</b>	<b>2.0</b>	<b>1.7</b>
PER MIL	81.7	78.8	83.3	79.4	79.3	103.3	102.9	102.6	93.6
SIZE (MW)	487	29	46	73	61	156	174	206	162
FREQ									



 **BNC: [ *having said that/this* , ]**

CLICK ON BARS FOR LIST OF MATCHING STRINGS

(HELP)

SECTION	SPOKEN	FICTION	NEWSPAPER	ACADEMIC	MISC
<b>SEE ALL SECTIONS</b>					
<b>PER MIL</b>	<b>5.9</b>	<b>0.4</b>	<b>2.1</b>	<b>1.6</b>	<b>3.0</b>
SIZE (MW)	10.0	15.9	10.5	15.3	44.6
FREQ	59	7	22	25	134

## The function of *that/this said* in Present-day English

- Safire (2002:E16) – *that said* is a rhetorical device
  - with it the speaker first presents the point to be negated, then his or her own argument
  - *that said* has two senses (1) ‘however’, which balances what goes before with what goes after, and (2) ‘nevertheless, in spite of that, even so’, which allows for “casting aspersions on all that has preceded”
- Beeching (forthcoming) – procatalepsis, a rhetorical figure that “allows a speaker to concede certain arguments and thus strengthen his or her main argument”
  - speaker concedes that there is an opposing view: this functions as a hedge/mitigator
  - then speaker is paradoxically able to more convincingly present own argument: this functions as a booster
  - in this way, the form functions as a (positive) politeness marker: speaker is attending to/protecting the hearer’s face, comes across as likeable and having a sense of fair play; form is interactional as it build solidarity between interlocutors

## Theories of the origin of *that/this said*

- John Lawler (cited in Safire 2002):
  - (with) *that having been said* is the source of *that said* (i.e., full > reduced clause)
- Jespersen (1946:46, 55):
  - that said* is the original construction (absolute constructions gained ground after 1660)
  - being* in the passive (i.e., *that being said*): “This more clumsy construction begins to appear in the 16<sup>th</sup> century”
  - having been said* – examples date from the 18<sup>th</sup> century
- Visser (1972:1259ff.):
  - generally, absolute constructions with the simple past participle are original, forms with *having/being/having been* are introduced in the modern period and are now often preferred (1266-67)
- Curme (1931:153):
  - absolute constructions without copula are original, more modern trend is to take tense (*having*) and voice (*having been*), especially when active



## History of *this/that said* construction

- Evidence suggests that the construction is of fairly recent origin:
  - Earliest examples in the OED: *that said* (1923); *that being said* (1908); *having said that* (1975); no examples of the other forms
  - No examples found in the following corpora of Early and Late Modern English:
    - *Helsinki Corpus of English Texts, Modern English Section* (1500–1710) 551,000 words
    - *Corpus of English Dialogues* (1560–1760) 1.2 million words
    - *Lampeter Corpus of Early Modern English Tracts* (1640–1710) 1.1 million words
    - *Corpus of Late 18C Prose* (1761–90) 300,000 words
- Additional corpora used:
  - CLEMT *Corpus of Late Modern English Texts* (1710–1920) 10 million words
  - CEN *Corpus of English Novels* (1881–1922) 25 million words
  - UofV *University of Virginia Electronic Text Center, Modern English Collection* (1500–present)
  - EEPF *Early English Prose Fiction* (1500–1700) 200 works
  - 18thCF *Eighteenth Century Fiction* (1700–1780) 96 works
  - *Early Canadiana Online* (18<sup>th</sup> c. - 1920) 3 million pages
  - ED *English Drama* (1280–1915) 3,900 plays
  - *TIME Corpus* (1923 – 2000)

## Middle English *this/that said*

- **And these wordes sayd**, she streyght her on length and rested a whyle (1387-88 T. Usk, Test. Love II, xiv (Skeat) 99; Visser 1972:1264)
- **this thus seid and sungun fro the clerkis** ... the preestis and peple fillen doun kneling (1449 Pecoock, Repressor 204, 4; Visser 1972:1265)
- **That sain And done**, torn my men vnto (1475 Partenay (EETS) 4132; Visser 1265:1265)
- **This saide**, the wiseman stilled. (1500 Alphonse, Disciplina Clericalis 172) 53; *MED*)



## Development of the *that/this having been/being said* construction

- Contra Lawler, there is no evidence of the construction being a reduced form of (*with*) *this/that having been said*: no examples found
- Parenthetical *that/this being said* is only slightly more common (9 examples found):
  - *This being said* with temporal/sequential meaning (2 early examples)
    - **This being said**, toward the port thai stevin (1513 Douglas, *Æneis* v.i.57; OED)
    - And this I will say, that in iudging me, you iudge more then me in it. **This being said**, it pleased her Maiesty to iudge that *Espilus* did the better diserue her (1598 Sidney, *The Lady of May*; ED)
  - *That/this being said* with concessive meaning (6 late 19<sup>th</sup>/20<sup>th</sup> century examples)
    - **That being said** we come to the question as to whether the work is worth the money (1900 Official Report of the House of Commons of the Dominion of Canada: Fifth Session, Eighth Parliament, p. 9663; ECO)
    - **This being said**, Mr. Hamilton and his colleagues of the executive council of the Territories will pardon me if I do not receive ... the assurance given by them ... (1894 Sessional Papers of the Dominion of Canada, Vol. 17, p. 57; ECO)



## Development of the *that/this said* construction

- In temporal/sequential uses, *this said* dates from late 16<sup>th</sup> c. and the earliest examples of *that said* from the early/mid-17<sup>th</sup> c.:
  - **This said**, impatience chokes her pleading tongue (1592-93 Shakespeare, *Venus and Adonis*; UofV)
  - she is a handsome picture, **And that said**, all is spoken (1636 Massinger, *The Great Duke of Florence*; ED)
- Concessive *that/this said* is more difficult to date:
  - A few (apparent) early examples of concessive *that/this said*:
    - They all are made my Lord, and some give out, That 'tis a blow given to religion, To weaken it, inruining of him, **That said**, he never wished more glorious title, Then to be called the scourge of Huguenots (1608 Chapman, *Charles Duke of Byron*; ED)
    - Then, daughter, grant me one request, To shew thou lovest me as thy sisters do, Accept a husband, whom my selfe will woo. **This sayd**, she cannot well deny my sute (1605 Anon., *King Leir*; ED)
  - Otherwise, examples of *that said* seem to date from the end of the Late Modern English period:
    - The change does not appear to be popular ... **That said**, there is little to criticize in the performance last night (1923 *Times* 14 Aug 5/2; OED)
  - I found no pre-contemporary examples of *this said*



## Development of the *having said this/that* construction

- In temporal/sequential uses, the construction dates from the early 17<sup>th</sup> to mid-18<sup>th</sup> century:
  - For who knowes not (quoth she) that this Hawke which comes now so faire to the fist, may to morrow check at the Lure. **Having said this**, shee wrote as hereafter followeth. (1606 Hind, *Eliosto Libidinoso*; EEPF)
  - Thus began an acquaintance equally fatal to my peace of mind and reputation; and **having said that**, it would be needless to repeat the circumstances of it (1744 Hayward, *The Fortunate Foundlings*; 18thCF)
- The concessive appears later. My earliest examples are:
  - **Having said all this**, I cannot help reflecting what a formal dull fellow, or a cloistered pedent, would say if they were to see this letter (1746-47 Chesterfield, *Letters to his Son*; CLMET)
  - I believe it would be possible ... to mount a convincing refutation of the argument ... However, **having said that**, I would add that I do not believe it is really necessary to defend the practice of Zen in that way (1975 Grimstone in K. Sekida, *Zen Training 21*; OED)





## Summary of dating

	<b>this said</b>	<b>that said</b>	<b>this being said</b>	<b>that being said</b>	<b>having said this</b>	<b>having said that</b>
Sequential	late 16 <sup>th</sup> c.	mid- 17 <sup>th</sup> c.	early 16 <sup>th</sup> c.	----	early 17 <sup>th</sup> c.	mid- 18 <sup>th</sup> c.
Concessive	?17 <sup>th</sup> c.	?17 <sup>th</sup> / 20 <sup>th</sup> c.	late 19 <sup>th</sup> c.	early 20 <sup>th</sup> c.	mid- 18 <sup>th</sup> c.	20 <sup>th</sup> c.



## Conclusions

- The concessive meaning develops from, and has replaced, the temporal/sequential meaning.
- The longer forms develop from the shorter forms.
- *That/this said* and *having said that/this* have separate histories.
- For the most part, the *that* forms have replaced the *this forms*.
- *That said* shows a marked increase in frequency beginning in about 1990.
- Semantic change in this construction conforms to well known paths of change.

 **TIME Corpus: rise in the use of *that said***

CLICK ON BARS FOR LIST OF MATCHING STRINGS

(HELP)

SECTION	1920s	1930s	1940s	1950s	1960s	1970s	1980s	1990s	2000s
SEE ALL SECTIONS									
<b>PER MIL</b>	<b>0.3</b>	<b>0.2</b>	<b>0.0</b>	<b>0.4</b>	<b>0.6</b>	<b>1.0</b>	<b>1.0</b>	<b>3.4</b>	<b>6.7</b>
SIZE (MW)	7.6	12.7	15.5	16.8	16.1	13.6	11.4	9.7	6.4
FREQ	2	3	0	6	10	13	11	33	43

 **From temporal (propositional) > concessive (procedural/pragmatic)**

Semantic change conforms to Traugott and Dasher's "correlated paths of directionality" (2002:40):

truth-conditional		>		non-truth-conditional
content	>	content/ procedural	>	procedural
scope within proposition	>	scope over proposition	>	scope over discourse
non-subjective	>	subjective	>	intersubjective



## REFERENCES

- Beeching, Kate. Forthcoming. Procatalepsis and the etymology of hedging and boosting particles. *Current Trends in Diachronic Semantics and Pragmatics*, ed. by Maj-Britt Mosegaard Hansen and Jacqueline Visconti. Emerald.
- Curme, George O. 1931. *A Grammar of the English Language*. Vol. II: *Syntax*. Boston: D.C. Heath. [Reprint Essex, CT: Verbatim, 1977.]
- Garner, Bryan A. 2003. *Modern American Usage*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.
- Huddleston, Rodney and Geoffrey K. Pullum. 2002. *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jespersen, Otto. 1946A *Modern Grammar on Historical Principles*. Part V: *Syntax, Fourth Volume*. London: George Allen & Unwin.
- Middle English Dictionary*. Electronic version available at the Middle English Compendium.  
<http://quod.lib.umich.edu/m/mec>
- Oxford English Dictionary*. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. online (in progress). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Poutsma, H. 1905. *A Grammar of Late Modern English*. Part I: *The Sentence* Section II: *The Composite Predicate*. Groningen: P. Noordhoff.
- Quirk, Randolph, Sidney Greenbaum, Geoffrey Leech, and Jan Svartvik. 1985. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London and New York: Longman.
- Safire, William. 2002. *That said: the battle cry of other handedness*. *New York Times*. Jun. 23 E6. *ProQuest Historical Newspapers The New York Times (1851-2006)*  
<http://proquest.umi.com/pqdweb?index=0&did=727234522&SrchMode=2&sid=3&Fmt=10&VInst=PROD&VType=PQD&RQT=309&VName=HNP&TS=1252858359&clientId=6993> (13 Sept. 2009)
- Visser, F.Th. 1972. *An Historical Syntax of the English Language*. Part Two: *Syntactical Units with one Verb (continued)*. Leiden: E.J. Brill.



## REFERENCES (Corpora)

- BNC *British National Corpus*. Searched using VIEW (Variation in English Words and Phrases) developed by Mark Davies, Brigham Young University. <http://corpus.byu.edu/bnc/>
- COCA *Corpus of Contemporary American English*. Developed by Mark Davies, Brigham Young University <http://www.americancorpus.org/>
- CED *A Corpus of English Dialogues 1560-1760*. Compiled by Merja Kytö and Jonathan Culpeper, in collaboration with Terry Walker and Dawn Archer. Uppsala University of Lancaster University. <http://www.engelska.uu.se/corpus.html>
- CEN *A Corpus of English Novels*. Compiled by Hendrik de Smet. <http://perswww.kuleuven.be/~u0044428/>
- Corpus of Late 18C Prose* (The English language of the north-west in the late Modern English period). Compiled by David Denison et al. <http://www.llc.manchester.ac.uk/subjects/lel/staff/david-denison/corpus-late-18th-century-prose/>
- CLMET *Corpus of Late Modern English Texts*. Compiled by Hendrik de Smet. <http://perswww.kuleuven.be/~u0044428/>
- ECO *Early Canadiana Online*. Produced by Canadiana.org. <http://wwaw.canadiana.org/>
- EETF *Early English Prose Fiction*. Ed. by Holger Klein et al. Chadwyck-Healey. ProQuest. [http://collections.chadwyck.com/home/home\\_eepf.jsp](http://collections.chadwyck.com/home/home_eepf.jsp)
- 18<sup>th</sup>CF *Eighteenth-Century Fiction*. Ed. by Judith Hawley, Tom Keymer, and John Mullan. Chadwyck-Healey. ProQuest. [http://collections.chadwyck.com/home/home\\_c18f.jsp](http://collections.chadwyck.com/home/home_c18f.jsp)
- ED *English Drama*. Ed. by John Barnard et al. Chadwyck-Healey. ProQuest. [http://collections.chadwyck.com/home/home\\_ed.jsp](http://collections.chadwyck.com/home/home_ed.jsp)
- Helsinki Corpus of English Texts*. Compiled by Merja Kytö et al. <http://kh.aksis.uib.no/icame/manuals/HC/INDEX.HTM#con11>
- Lampeter Corpus of Early Modern English Tracts*. Compiled by Josef Schmied et al. <http://khnt.hit.uib.no/icame/manuals/LAMPETER/LAMPHOME.HTM>
- TIME *Time Corpus 1923-2000*. Developed by Mark Davies, Brigham Young University <http://corpus.byu.edu/time/>